



**The World Bank**

**Review and Update of the World Bank’s Environmental and Social Safeguard Policies  
China: Dialogue with Ethnic Minorities  
Feedback Summary**

A dialogue with Government officials and representatives from academia, project management offices and Ethnic Minorities was held on November 12-13, 2013 in Beijing, China. This regional dialogue is part of a global dialogue with Indigenous Peoples that the World Bank held to seek input to the safeguard policies review and update process. A [term of reference](#) of the global dialogue is available on the website. After an overview presentation by the Bank on the safeguard policy review process, participants shared their thoughts on the safeguard update process as well as their thoughts on a number of specific issues important to Ethnic Minorities. The table below summarizes points raised during the dialogue.

---

**Date: November\_12-13, 2013**

**Venue: Beijing, China**

**Total Number of Participants: 40 (including Government officials and representatives from academia, project management offices and Ethnic Minorities)**

<b>A. Lessons Learned From Strategies and Programs for Development of Ethnic Minorities</b>	
<b>1.</b>	<p>What is the vision for the development of Ethnic Minorities? What are the main premises of this vision? What has been most important in achieving progress?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Chinese Government’s policy on Ethnic Minorities is in line with the Bank’s Operational Policy in terms of: (a) promoting development of Ethnic Minorities; and (b) minimizing negative impacts on Ethnic Minorities.</li> <li>• The Chinese Government has supported development of Ethnic Minorities by implementing targeted policies, plans and twinning mechanisms/arrangements, and by providing earmarked financial support.</li> </ul>
<b>2.</b>	<p>What has worked in China to allow for the effective engagement of Ethnic Minorities on development at the policy and strategy levels?</p>

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Bank policies on Ethnic Minorities have helped China improving its own policies for Ethnic Minorities. For example, China’s Resettlement Policy No.17 was enhanced by including ‘resettlement should observe tradition, cultural habits of Ethnic Minorities’ after implementing World Bank projects.</li> <li>• The Community Driven Development (CDD) model was successfully adopted in the Economic Reform Implementation Project (TCC5), and the experience from this has been applied in local poverty alleviation projects.</li> </ul>
<b>3. What can be done to more rapidly reduce poverty among Ethnic Minorities?</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Strengthen cooperation with the Bank to expand procurement by Fortune 500 companies of products from Ethnic Minority enterprises.</li> <li>• Work together with the Bank to support development of handicraft industry in Ethnic Minority areas, using the Bank’s experience in management, marketing, technical training and beneficiary participation to expand employment and increase income of Ethnic Minority groups.</li> <li>• Provide employment opportunities and skills training to Ethnic Minorities, support to set up businesses, and invest more in education for Ethnic Minority people.</li> </ul>
<b>4. What can be done to increase shared prosperity among Ethnic Minorities?</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) and Resettlement Action Plans (RAP) have been included as mandatory requirements in China’s project approval process, and resources are thus allocated to carry them out. Social Assessment (SA) and Ethnic Minorities Development Plans (EDMP) should also be included as mandatory requirements to improve enforcement of the policy. SA and plans are important because they directly impact resource redistribution, which is key in promoting shared prosperity.</li> <li>• There is a need to further study how to achieve economic development of Ethnic Minorities while maintaining their culture and identity, as well as how to balance short term economic benefits with longer term sustainable livelihoods. Economic benefits can be achieved in the short term through significant investment in tourism and other suitable activities, but if local environment and unique culture are compromised, they can be almost impossible to repair.</li> </ul>
<b>5. What can be done to expand the role of Ethnic Minorities in supporting sustainable development?</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Involve Ethnic Minority communities in follow-up management of projects.</li> </ul>
<b>6. What are the key lessons learned from Chinese experience in supporting the development and engagement of Ethnic Minorities?</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Develop and implement special plans targeted at Ethnic Minorities.</li> </ul>
<b>B. Lessons Learned from Project Preparation and Implementation</b>
<b>1. What are the key elements that lead to success in the preparation and implementation of projects focused on Ethnic Minorities?</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Borrowing countries need to improve coordination among line ministries to integrate resources for holistic project design, so that budget earmarked for specific purposes can be mobilized to fund relevant components of the project. For example, the budget from Commission of Ethnic Minority Affairs could be integrated into a project if the Commission is involved early on during project preparation.</li> </ul>
<b>2. What are the key challenges in projects focused on Ethnic Minorities and how can these issues be addressed?</b>

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• In some cases where the policy on Ethnic Minorities was triggered, the local project management office (PMO) was inclined to drop the area concerned because they lacked resources to prepare and implement the required Ethnic Minorities Plan. To tackle this problem, it should be made clear that borrowers must prepare a budget for this purpose.</li> <li>• During project preparation, social experts were involved at a later stage than technical experts, and the opportunity to integrate social issues into project preparation early on was lost. Therefore it is suggested that social experts should be involved early in project preparation.</li> <li>• Lack of capacity is a challenge especially at lower levels of PMOs. Capacity building should be provided as was done for the involuntary resettlement policy.</li> <li>• Internal approval processes require a feasibility study approved by the government. If the feasibility study does not cover compliance with Ethnic Minority requirements, then it becomes difficult to adjust project design to address social impacts and meet the needs of Ethnic Minorities.</li> </ul>
<p>What are the critical issues related to full and effective participation of Ethnic Minorities in projects?</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Involve Ethnic Minority communities in the monitoring and evaluation process, in particular of any Ethnic Minorities Plans</li> <li>• Design of project activities should reflect local needs, which may change over time.</li> </ul>
<p><b>3.</b> How can Ethnic Minorities be more involved in the preparation and implementation of World Bank projects?</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• It is very important to engage Ethnic Minorities so as to hear their voices during project preparation; this will help to ensure project sustainability.</li> <li>• Project design should incorporate and reflect the needs of Ethnic Minorities.</li> <li>• Innovation in community organizations should be fostered so that they can take a leading role in community development and management and participate fully in project preparation, implementation, monitoring and evaluation.</li> </ul>
<p><b>4.</b> What measures have proven most effective in monitoring of project progress during implementation? What role(s) can be undertaken by members of Ethnic Minority communities in project monitoring?</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ethnic Minority communities should be engaged in monitoring project progress. Members may take a leading role in project monitoring, as has been done in some projects.</li> </ul>
<p><b>5.</b> What are the key lessons learned from Chinese experience in supporting the preparation and implementation of projects focused on development of Ethnic Minorities?</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Project preparation should respect local knowledge to capture and reflect reality on the ground.</li> <li>• It is helpful to link Ethnic Minority policy implementation with local poverty reduction policies in order to ensure political and financial support.</li> <li>• Action plans need to be included in the EMDP so that they are effectively implemented.</li> <li>• Supervision of EMDP implementation will improve enforcement of the plan.</li> <li>• PMOs should identify local needs by conducting household interviews on a regular basis.</li> <li>• Critical infrastructure should be provided to local communities, development of local unique industries should be supported and measures taken to ensure protection and development of Ethnic Minority culture, including non-physical cultural resources.</li> </ul>

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ethnic Minorities should be mobilized to participate in project implementation by providing them with temporary employment opportunities in the project.</li> </ul>
<b>C. Lessons Learned from Application of World Bank Operational Policy (OP) 4.10 on Ethnic Minorities</b>
<b>1.</b> What are the key elements that lead to success in the preparation and implementation of projects that involved application of World Bank OP 4.10 on Ethnic Minorities?
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Project design, preparation and implementation should respect local knowledge and customs.</li> <li>• Minority development needs to be integrated with local poverty risk reduction.</li> <li>• Effective monitoring and evaluation of EMDP contributes to optimizing project design and adapting implementation plans as needed.</li> </ul>
<b>2.</b> What are the key challenges in projects that have applied the World Bank OP 4.10 on Ethnic Minorities and how can these be addressed?
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Often only children and elderly people are available in rural areas when the social assessment is undertaken. This weakens the quality of community participation, and makes it challenging for social experts to achieve full and appropriate representation during the SA. To address this issue, mobile phones and the internet may be used to ensure participating in community decisions/villager assemblies.</li> <li>• Pressure from the government and the World Bank regarding project schedules can impede effective participation of communities in Ethnic Minority areas as community participation often takes time to achieve.</li> </ul>
<b>3.</b> What types of changes or clarifications should be included in a revised version of the World Bank OP 4.10 to make it more effective and implementable at the field level?
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Further clarify criteria for identifying Ethnic Minorities: whether one or all four criteria shall be satisfied; whether the majority of Ethnic Minority people benefiting from a project refers to the majority under a component or the entire project.</li> <li>• Clarify specific circumstances that require compliance with OP 4.10.</li> <li>• Clarify objectives of EMDP monitoring and evaluation and develop guidelines, similar to those on involuntary resettlement; prepare a monitoring and evaluation manual and identify monitoring indicators.</li> <li>• Clearly define the scope of the EMDP and sources of funding for IPP preparation.</li> <li>• Clearly define what types of projects need to prepare and EMDP and ensure that there are operational guidelines and rules governing EMDP preparation.</li> </ul>
<b>4.</b> What are the key lessons from the conduct of social assessments and their application in the preparation of Ethnic Minority Frameworks and Ethnic Minority Development Plans?
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• An EMDP shall be accompanied by an Action Plan.</li> <li>• Clearly define and ensure adequate resources for preparation of EMDP.</li> <li>• Build capacity of grassroots level implementing units in preparing EMDP through training and other approaches.</li> <li>• Simplify EMDP: whether activities already covered in the SA can be dropped and if yes, whether a 2-4 page improved action plan would be sufficient, or whether a stand-alone EMDP is still needed.</li> <li>• EMDP design and implementation should respect local culture and customs</li> <li>• EMDP implementation and monitoring should be supported with adequate funding.</li> </ul>