Raising Standards for Sustainable Development

Update and Review of the World Bank’s Safeguard Policies for Investment Project Finance

Civil Society Policy Forum

Spring Meetings 2015
Main Feedback from Consultations

Environmental and Social Framework (ESF)

- Biodiversity Conservation and Sustainable Management of Living Natural Resources (ESS6)
  - Cover Climate Change in ESF
  - Provide special considerations for Indigenous Peoples
  - Include animal welfare
  - Consider supply chains
  - Use terminology consistent to IFC
- Land Acquisition, Restrictions on Land Use and involuntary Resettlement (ESS5)
  - Make Voluntary Guidelines mandatory
  - Cover land titling
  - Clarify forced evictions
  - Clarify timing of resettlement instruments
- Community Health and Safety (ESS4)
  - Cover child rights
  - Require disaster response and preparedness
  - Cover Climate Change in ESF
  - Provide standalone public health standard
- Risk assessment and management (ESS1)
  - Include human rights assessment
  - Do not include explicit human rights commitments
  - Reference Human Rights instruments
  - Strengthen the use of Borrower Frameworks
  - Limit the use of Borrower Frameworks
  - Clarify the grounds for acceptable use of Borrower Frameworks
- Resource Efficiency and Pollution Prevention (ESS3)
  - Include strong requirements for Greenhouse Gas Accounting
  - Cover Climate Change in ESF
  - Include explicit requirements for ecosystems
  - Address burden on Borrower
- Labor and working conditions (ESS2)
  - Include all ILO core principles
  - Include explicit references to ILO Conventions/Declaration
- Indigenous Peoples (ESS7)
  - Maintain as major gain over current policies
  - Address concerns about eminent domain
- Financial Intermediaries (ESS3)
  - Clarify definitions
  - Include chance first procedures
  - Provide compensation
- Cultural Heritage (ESS8)
  - Modify alternative approach
  - Abandon alternative approach
- Information Disclosure and Stakeholder Engagement (ESS10)
  - Expand definition of stakeholders and stakeholder mapping
  - Strengthen information disclosure
  - Strengthen grievance redress mechanism
- Add standalone SOGE standard
- Add standalone gender standard
- Include integrated standard for all vulnerable groups
- Remove specific examples of groups for non-discrimination
- Broaden social risk coverage
- Adaptive risk management
- Strengthen illicit monitoring
- Limit scope
- Cover all workers
- Include all ILO core principles
Risk Assessment and Management (ESS1)

Requirements for the process of assessing and managing environmental and social risk for project appraisal

What we heard

• **Non-discrimination**: mostly welcomed with caveats about implementation
• **Risk classification**: clarify distinction between high and substantial risk
• **Adaptive risk management**: concerned over too much Borrower discretion and Bank capacity to monitor
• **Use of borrower frameworks**: some Borrowers advocate for use of borrower frameworks, donors prefer the Bank’s framework to be default
• **Human Rights**: include do no harm commitment, reference international conventions, no funding for human rights violations, human rights impact assessment

Being considered

• **Non-discrimination**: maintain proposed principle
• **Risk classification**: draw sharper distinction between high and substantial risk
• **Approach to borrower frameworks**: ensure consistency with Bank ESF objectives and outcomes
• **Human Rights**: include clear reference in Vision Statement
# Labor and Working Conditions (ESS2)

Requirements for protecting workers in Bank-financed projects (1\textsuperscript{st} WB standard on labor)

## What we heard

- **Scope**: expand scope of coverage to include contractors and sub-contractors, government employees, supply chain, informal work sector

- **Core standards**: include general right to collective bargaining and freedom of association

- **References to international conventions**: refer to ILO core standards and/or Declaration

## Being considered

- **Scope**: extend application so that contractors and sub-contractors, government employees, workers in the supply chain, and informal work sector are covered by the requirements of ESS2

- **Core standards**: include all ILO core standards (including freedom of association and right to collective bargaining)

- **References to international conventions**: consider whether and where to embed
## Resource Efficiency and Pollution Prevention (ESS3)
Requirements for cleaner production, handling resources efficiently, and preventing and managing pollution

### What we heard

- **Greenhouse gas accounting**: considered burdensome and too expensive for Borrowers; some Borrowers see it as political issue and part of international climate negotiations

- **Environmental, Health, and Safety (EHS) Guidelines**: make mandatory vs. use as technical reference documents

- **Language**: clarify definitions of technical and financial feasibility

- **Climate change**: include requirements for climate change adaptation and resilience

### Being considered

- **Greenhouse gas accounting**: require for certain projects

- **EHS Guidelines**: clarify purpose/use of Guidelines

- **Climate change**: cover climate change adaptation and resilience in ESF
Community Health and Safety (ESS4)

Requirements for health, safety, and security risks and impacts on project-affected communities

What we heard

• **Climate change**: strengthen provisions on climate change adaptation and resilience

• **Vulnerable groups**: focus on impacts on groups such as children and gender

• **Public health**: include enhanced provisions on public health, including communicable diseases

Being considered

• **Climate change**: include specific provisions for climate adaptation and resilience throughout the ESF

• **Vulnerable groups**: include non-explicit references throughout ESF and prepare Guidance Notes

• **Public health**: clarify and expand existing text
Land Acquisition, Restrictions on Land Use and Involuntary Resettlement (ESS5)

Requirements to prevent adverse effects of land acquisition in Bank-financed projects

What we heard

- **Land titling**: concerns about perceived exemption of land titling
- **Resettlement**: treat resettlement activities as separate sustainable development programs
- **Gender**: more inclusive treatment of gender issues in land acquisition (e.g., property rights for women, women as heads of household)

Being considered

- **Land titling**: clarify provisions for land titling
- **Resettlement**: clarify and expand upon the existing text, which allows for treating resettlement activities as separate sustainable development programs
- **Gender**: make appropriate text changes
### Biodiversity Conservation and Sustainable Management of Living Natural Resources (ESS6)

Requirements for protecting living organisms and responsibly managing scarce resources

#### What we heard

- **Offsets**: clarify that offsets are only a last resort in the mitigation hierarchy and prevent offsets in critical habitats
- **Loopholes**: ensure that logging and hydropower projects cannot avoid adhering to mitigation hierarchy suggested in ESS6

#### Being considered

- Clarify and elaborate on offsets, critical habitats, and definitions of core terms
### Indigenous Peoples (ESS7)

Special considerations for Indigenous Peoples affected by Bank-financed projects to avoid negative effects and enable their access to development benefits

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What we heard</th>
<th>Being considered</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Alternative approach</strong>: concerns that alternative approach would not maintain requirements of OP 4.10</td>
<td><strong>Alternative approach</strong>: consider various options</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>FPIC</strong>: praise for FPIC vs. reservations about FPIC’s conformity with national legislation</td>
<td><strong>FPIC</strong>: clarify scope and application as well as FPIC vs. eminent domain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Target group</strong>: concerns over title of Standard and definition of target group; concerns over differentiated treatment of IPs vs. other affected groups</td>
<td><strong>Target group</strong>: modify title of ESS and amend definition of target group (e.g., traditional groups, tribal and Indigenous Peoples); clarify how non-indigenous vulnerable or marginalized groups will be safeguarded</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Cultural Heritage (ESS8), Financial Intermediaries (ESS9), Information Disclosure & Stakeholder Engagement (ESS10)

Requirements to protect the physical environment of cultural heritage sites; Requirements for managing environmental and social risk in Financial Intermediaries; Requirements for access to information and stakeholder participation in Bank-financed projects

What we heard

ESS8
- **Scope**: include intangible cultural heritage

ESS9
- **Justification**: no need for separate ESS on Financial Intermediaries
- **Application**: apply to projects with high as well as substantial risk

ESS10
- **Engagement**: strengthen engagement process
- **Grievance mechanisms**: strengthen requirements

Being considered

ESS8
- **Scope**: include more explicit protection requirements for intangible cultural heritage in ESS8

ESS9
- **Application**: expand coverage of ESS to include sub-projects with high and substantial risk

ESS10
- **Clarify and provide further information in guidance notes**
Consultation feedback available at: