1. Background

The World Bank is reviewing and updating its environmental and social safeguard policies in three distinct review phases from 2012 to 2016. The approach to the review is described in an Approach Paper titled "The World Bank's Safeguard Policies: Proposed Review and Update¹," which was endorsed by the Committee on Development Effectiveness (CODE) of the World Bank's Board of Executive Directors on October 10, 2012.

As part of this review, the World Bank is consulting with shareholders and stakeholders to seek their input into and feedback on the development of an updated set of policies that mark the cornerstone of the institution's efforts to protect people and the environment and to achieve its goals to end extreme poverty and promote shared prosperity in a sustainable manner in all partner countries. In Phase 3 of the review, the World Bank will seek feedback from borrowing countries and other stakeholders on a list of issues identified by Executive Directors to be discussed, on the resources needed and the feasibility of applying the proposed Environmental and Social Framework (ESF) in borrowing countries. The indicative list of issues for Phase 3 consultations can be accessed online².

2. Consultation objectives

The main objective of the review is to strengthen the effectiveness of the safeguard policies in order to enhance the development impact of World Bank-supported projects and programs. World Bank Management anticipates that the review process will lead to a cohesive framework that will distinguish principles, policies, and procedures; enhance policy clarity and coherence; clarify objectives and desired outcomes; improve synergy across policies; consolidate fragmented or duplicative policies; streamline guidance; and better delineate roles and responsibilities of the World Bank and the Borrower.

The multi-stage review of the World Bank's environmental and safeguard policies is supported by three phases of global multi-stakeholder consultations to elicit input and feedback from interested stakeholders in as broad, inclusive, and transparent a manner as possible. The objectives of the consultation process are to:

• Shape and inform the development of a framework of the next generation of safeguard policies that will benefit multiple stakeholders.

¹ http://siteresources.worldbank.org/EXTSAFEPOL/Resources/584434-1306431390058/SafeguardsReviewApproachPaper.pdf

² https://consultations.worldbank.org/Data/hub/files/consultation-template/review-and-update-world-bank-safeguard-policies/en/materials/list of issues for consultations.pdf

- Create a space for dialogue and participation of stakeholders so that the proposed revisions of the policies as well as their future implementation can benefit from different perspectives.
- Help frame and guide the formulation of specific revisions, taking into account implications for implementation and operations.
- Shape the World Bank's approach to implementing the newly developed framework.

The envisaged outcomes of the consultation include:

- A third proposed Environmental and Social Framework for consideration by the World Bank's Executive Directors, which will consider and reflect stakeholder input as appropriate.
- A consultation report including a summary of stakeholder feedback for each of the three consultation phases.
- A response from the Bank on how stakeholder feedback informed the third draft of the policy framework.

3. Approach to consultations

The review process includes three consultation phases to allow for input and feedback from shareholders and stakeholders. The first consultation phase was dedicated to discussing lessons learned from the implementation of the current World Bank safeguard policies as well as any principles the new generation of policies should be based on. The second phase was dedicated to a detailed discussion of ten proposed Environmental and Social Standards as well as a proposed Environmental and Social Policy and Vision. The third phase will focus on approaches to implement the second draft Environmental and Social Framework as well as on outstanding issues defined by Executive Directors of the World Bank. An overview of the review process and related activities in provided in Table 1.

Table 1. Indicative timeline and key review activities

Timeline	Phase	Description
July 2012 –	Phase 1	A global review of good practice/lessons learned
July 2014		Preparation and presentation to CODE of the Approach Paper
		• Initial consultations with shareholders and internal stakeholders
		• External consultations seeking input on opportunities, emerging directions and options to inform drafting of a framework

		• Evnort martings on amarging issues
		 Expert meetings on emerging issues Preparation of an initial draft of an Environmental and Social Framework, incorporating the objectives of the
		review and update process and taking into account feedback received from stakeholders
Timeline	Phase	Description
July 2014 – June 2015	Phase 2	Report to CODE on the outcome of the first review phase and presentation of initial draft Environmental and Social Framework
		• Pre-consultation period of 1 month to allow stakeholders to familiarize themselves with the framework
		• External consultations seeking feedback on initial draft Framework for a period of 7 months
		• Report to Executive Directors on the outcome of the Phase 2 consultations
		• Internal collaboration with Global Practices, Cross- Cutting Solutions Areas, Task Team Leads and other staff across the WBG
		Preparation of second draft Framework that takes into account feedback received from stakeholders
July 2015 – Early 2016 (TBC)	Phase 3	Report to CODE on the outcome of the second review phase and presentation of second draft Environmental and Social Framework
		Consultation period of 4 months, seeking feedback on the second draft ESF from shareholders and external stakeholders
		• Internal collaboration with Global Practices, Cross- Cutting Solutions Areas, Task Team Leads and other staff across the WBG
		Road-testing of the proposed ESF using current World Bank-supported projects
		Report to Executive Director on feedback received and outcome of the third phase of the review
		• Preparation of third draft ESF and implementation plan,

	taking into account feedback received from stakeholders,
	to be presented to the Board of Executive Directors for
	approval in early 2016

The World Bank is hosting a dedicated consultation website³ that provides access to consultation materials, consultation schedules and consultation summaries. Consultations are conducted following international good practice and the World Bank's consultation guidelines⁴.

Phase 1: Lessons learned, principles

Following the discussion of the Approach Paper by CODE in October 2012, the World Bank initiated the first phase of consultations with shareholders, internal stakeholders, and a wide range of external participants to seek inputs on opportunities, emerging directions, and options to inform the drafting of a new proposed policy framework. The consultation was exploratory, gathering stakeholder input to help shape a revised set of safeguard policies. Consultations were held online and face-to-face from October 2012 to April 2013, reaching more than 2,000 stakeholders from over 40 countries from all regions across the world. The consultative process included dedicated meetings with Indigenous Peoples and project-affected people as well as expert meetings on 'emerging areas' such as climate change, human rights, labor, and land tenure. In parallel, a global review of good practices and lessons learned was conducted, including of other multilateral development banks. The World Bank also began a worldwide dialogue with Indigenous Peoples⁵ leaders and organizations. This dialogue is ongoing. A summary of the input received⁶ from consultations in Phase 1 of the review as well as information on the overall consultation process can be found on the dedicated consultation website.

Phase 2: Environmental and Social Standards

On July 30, 2014, CODE discussed a first draft of the Environmental and Social Framework, which included ten draft Environmental and Social Standards, a draft Environmental and Social Policy, and a proposed Vision Statement. Committee members authorized the release of the proposal document for the purpose of consulting with stakeholders on the specific proposals. The World Bank conducted the second consultation phase from July 31, 2014, to March 1, 2015. This consultation was the largest engagement effort on a policy reform undertaken by the World Bank

http://consultations.worldbank.org/Data/hub/files/safeguards review terms of reference for ip regional dialogue 2013.pdf

³ www.worldbank.org/safeguardsconsultations

⁴ http://consultations.worldbank.org/Data/hub/files/documents/world_bank_consultation_guidelines_oct_2013_0.pdf

⁶ http://consultations.worldbank.org/Data/hub/files/consultation-template/review-and-update-world-bank-safeguard-policies/en/phases/safeguards consultations phase1 feedback summary 0.pdf

or other development partners to date. Consultations included participants from 65 countries across all regions, including 54 borrower countries. More than 130 position papers have been received from governments, Indigenous Peoples leaders and project affected communities. Stakeholders consulted included representatives from government, civil society organizations, United Nations agencies; multilateral mandate holders; multilateral and bilateral development partners; private sector representatives; development-oriented organizations and foundations; academic and applied research institutions; professional organizations and societies; labor organizations; Indigenous Peoples leaders and representatives; and civil society organizations at international, national and local level involved in advocacy or service delivery. They provided their feedback during face-to-face discussions, in audio and video conferences, expert focus groups, and through online submissions to the consultation website. The consultation process focused on seeking input on the first draft of the Framework and in particular on key changes that would strengthen its effectiveness. A summary of feedback received during consultations as well as World Bank responses is available online⁷.

Phase 3: Feasibility of implementation and outstanding issues

After consulting on the specific proposed standards, the World Bank revised the first draft ESF, taking consultation feedback into account. A second draft framework was presented to CODE on June 24, 2015 and further discussed on July 1, 2015. Executive Directors authorized a third consultation phase, while acknowledging that it was apparent that further discussion was required on various aspects, notably the Vision statement, some Standards, and sensitivity/ambition of language. Equally, Executive Directors noted that further clarity was needed on implementability of the ESF and potential impact on borrowers. CODE therefore tasked Management to focus the consultations on gathering feedback on the implementability of the ESF in borrowing countries and requested that the consultation package should include an indicative list of issues to be further explored during consultations⁸.

The CODE paper (titled "Consultation Paper), the second draft ESF, the draft Environmental and Social Procedure, the indicative list of issues for Phase 3 consultations, the summary of Phase 2 consultations and Bank responses as well as this consultation plan have been publicly disclosed on the dedicated consultation website. The third consultation phase is envisaged to last 4 months.

 $^{^{7}\ \}underline{https://consultations.worldbank.org/Data/hub/files/consultation-template/review-and-update-world-bank-safeguard-}$

policies/en/materials/clean_summary_of_phase_2_consultations_and_bank_management_reponses_final_draft_for_consultation_july_1_2015.pdf

⁸ https://consultations.worldbank.org/Data/hub/files/consultation-template/review-and-update-world-bank-safeguard-policies/en/materials/list_of_issues_for_consultations.pdf

Consultations are envisaged to include technical discussions and implementation workshops to consider project case studies with government, especially with implementing agencies; implementation workshops to consider case studies with experts and practitioners from international organizations, civil society, private sector, and academia; as well as general consultations with civil society and other stakeholders. Expert focus groups may be hosted by the World Bank or by an external partner from academia, civil society or the private sector.

In addition to workshops and other face-to-face meetings, the World Bank will utilize online channels to engage with stakeholders and will host globally accessible online consultations.

4. Consultation process

A dedicated consultation web page (<u>www.worldbank.org/safeguardsconsultations</u>) will provide a platform for shareholders and stakeholders to provide input, participate in discussions, and contribute to the review. Interested individuals and parties can provide written comments through this website or by email to <u>safeguardconsult@worldbank.org</u>.

The webpage includes information related to the review and timeline, consultation process, relevant background information, related resources, the schedule (as it is confirmed) and other relevant information.

Key consultation documents (the second draft ESF, the draft Environmental and Social Procedures, the CODE paper ("Consultation Paper") and the indicative list of issues for consultations) will be made available in Arabic, Chinese, English, French, Portuguese, Russian and Spanish. Translations into additional languages, including Braille, may be provided throughout the consultation process.

Participants will be identified by the World Bank in collaboration with partners from governments, implementing agencies, international organizations, civil society, private sector, and academia.

The World Bank will strive for diversity among participants with regard to interest, region, professional background, and sector. Particular attention will be paid to ensuring access to members of vulnerable or marginalized groups, including stakeholders living in hard to reach areas. All interested stakeholders are invited to provide comments in written form.

Participants for expert consultations will be selected based on their practical experience with implementing aspects of the proposed ESF (such as impact assessment, risk mitigation, project design, design and application of risk mitigation instruments, project monitoring, working with vulnerable groups and other work relevant to the proposed ESF).

Invitations to general consultation meetings will be issued at least two weeks before the meeting. Stakeholders who are interested in attending a civil society consultation meeting but have not received an invitation can register with the World Bank. Accessibility for persons with disabilities and adequate protections of vulnerable groups will be ensured.

Consultation meetings follow Chatham House Rules. The World Bank will provide a written summary of each consultation meeting and will ask participants to review and, if needed, edit summaries before publishing them on the consultation website. When presenting the third draft ESF to Executive Directors, the World Bank will provide a high-level summary of Phase 3 consultation feedback together with responses on how feedback was used.

5. Contact

Questions about the review and consultation process should be directed to the Safeguards Review team at safeguardconsult@worldbank.org.