



**Review and Update of the World Bank's Environmental and Social Safeguard Policies
Phase 2
Feedback Summary**

Date: October 27, 2014

Location (City, Country): Hanoi, Vietnam

Audience (Government, CSO, etc.): Ethnic Minorities

Overview and Key Issues Discussed: Key issues discussed included: sustainable development and assistance; ethnic language; women in ethnic minority communities; Trung Son Hydropower project; national forest management policy; consultation and information sharing; and FPIC. **This summary is subject to change after review and comments from consultation participants.**

Specific Feedback from Stakeholders
1. General Comments
N/A
2. <i>A Vision for Sustainable Development</i>
N/A
3. <i>World Bank Environmental and Social Policy</i>
N/A
4. <i>Environmental and Social Standard 1 (ESS1): Assessment and Management of Environmental and Social Risks and Impacts</i>
N/A
5. <i>Environmental and Social Standard 2 (ESS2): Labor and Working Conditions</i>
N/A
6. <i>Environmental and Social Standard 3 (ESS3): Resource Efficiency and Pollution Prevention</i>
N/A
7. <i>Environmental and Social Standard 4 (ESS4): Community Health and Safety</i>

N/A

8. Environmental and Social Standard 5 (ESS5): Land Acquisition, Restriction on Land Use and Involuntary Resettlement

N/A

9. Environmental and Social Standard 6 (ESS6): Biodiversity Conservation and Sustainable Management of Living Natural Resources

N/A

10. Environmental and Social Standard 7 (ESS7): Indigenous Peoples

Comments and recommendations

- In Vietnam, not all Hmong people can write their own **language** any more. We wish the Bank supports us to preserve our language writing. The government does not allow us to learn and disseminate the Hmong international language writing, and encourages us to learn Hmong Vietnamese writing, which is more difficult to remember.
- The Ede ethnic minority has one of the highest poverty rates in the country. There is a preferential treatment for the poor household in this group. They are eligible for VND 20 million of loans per household only while the government policy is to allow a loan of VND 50 million. This is not enough even for purchasing a couple of cows, which cost at least VND25 million. The Ede language is also disappearing. They also face a lot of difficulties in securing daily water consumption due to water pollution. Bank support would be needed for poverty reduction of these communities.
- The support to ethnic minority groups needs to be **sustainable and long-term**.
- The government has introduced a **reforestation policy**. There is a conflict between this policy and our needs for **animal husbandry**. If we cannot use the forest areas for grazing the animals, our children will have to take care of animals and cannot go to school. In addition, when we need wood for building houses and cut tree in the forest, the government official says it is the violation of the policy. We have a good sense of forest management but if we cannot use it why we have to protect it. The national policy should incorporate the needs of ethnic minorities.
- **Traditional medicinal herbs** of ethnic minorities are declining, and needs support together with forest preservation.
- Projects proposed for ethnic minorities must be **culturally appropriate**.
- The products made by ethnic minorities should be sold at the price closer to the **market price**.
- **Schools** in ethnic minority communities do not have pipeline running water. This should be supported by the government.
- When **consulting** with ethnic minorities, the investors should know more about our needs, instead of simply asking our answer with yes or no for defined activities. We need more information and time to answer.
- In this meeting, we have broad representation from the north to the south. We can facilitate the policy implementation. However, we have more ethnic groups in the country and some of them may not support the policy.
- The Bank should make the consultation with ethnic minorities **broader and mandatory**. I understand that currently only the consultation for EIA is mandatory. Many local leaders have a perception that ethnic minority groups are ignorant and no need to consult with them. The educational level is improving in ethnic minorities.

- The ethnic minorities face poor conditions in the living, transport and other issues. More attention and investment is needed.
- Many **women in ethnic minority communities** are illiterate. They do not know about the laws on gender equality and also don't know how to protect against domestic violence.
- The introduction of **FPIC** is good. But it is critical to consider how to ensure full information is shared with them. **Information sharing** with ethnic minorities is not always comprehensive.
- My community is beneficiary of the **Bank's phase 2 poverty reduction project**. We benefit greatly from renting animals under the project. The current IP policy is already very good. I appreciate that the proposed ESS7 will become even better.
- We are happy with Bank support to **Trung Son Hydropower** project. The road conditions in the poor community are much better. We have received assistance from the authorities in the project implementation, including livelihood training for local peoples in agricultural production and animal husbandry. On the other hand, the resettled community from the reservoir has concern for the future. In the new resettlement area, new lands and houses were given. But they face limitations in the livelihood. The Bank should visit and talk with the local households, and you will understand their situation better and what their needs are. The hydropower projects other than Trung Son project apparently receive less attention and assistance.

11. Environmental and Social Standard 8 (ESS8): Cultural Heritage

N/A

12. Environmental and Social Standard 9 (ESS9): Financial Intermediaries

N/A

13. Environmental and Social Standard 10 (ESS10): Information Disclosure and Stakeholder Engagement

N/A