



**The World Bank**

## **REVIEW and UPDATE of the WORLD BANK'S ENVIRONMENTAL and SOCIAL SAFEGUARD POLICIES**

### **Multi-Stakeholder Consultation Meeting - Government representatives, ASTANA, Kazakhstan - March 29, 2013**

A multi-stakeholder meeting with representatives of the government was held on March 29, 2013 to discuss the World Bank Safeguards review and update process. The meeting was facilitated by Zhanna Rysakova (see Annex 1 - participants list). After a presentation by the World Bank Safeguards Review Team on the background, intended scope and process for the review, the floor was open for participants' questions and comments. Suggestions are outlined below:

- It is necessary to identify and resolve discrepancies between Bank requirements and national legislation during the preparation and negotiation processes, before the project implementation starts. It would be beneficial to consider the experience of already implemented/on-going projects;
- The deadline for project implementation is too short and unrealistic taking into account the procedures required by national legislation. It is required to postpone deadlines on implementation before the ratification of a project/program;
- OP 4.12 – There is concern over discrepancies between the procedures of the Bank and national legislation in the area of land/home procurement, resettlement, compensation rates, additional payments, transportation costs and deadlines for compensation payments. Differences in compensation standards and local budget requirements create barriers to compliance with Bank policies. Land acquisition must be done early in order to maintain schedules, but if it is done prior to the Bank project becoming effective (i.e., before the Loan Agreement), it must follow Kazakh laws (in absence of a signed Bank Legal Agreement with other requirements). Then, for Bank approval, it must take retroactive measures, often including incremental payments. A mechanism is needed that authorizes Bank requirements to be followed before the specific Legal Agreement is signed;
- Weather conditions are another issue to consider with regard to the need for longer project duration, for example, in North Kazakhstan, civil works and constructions activities cannot be undertaken during winter;

- It is necessary to coordinate the Bank's policies with the national legislation on procurement; for example, when Kazakhstan state-owned companies are ineligible to bid, there might be no private companies available.
- Bank assistance would be beneficial in fighting forest pests, identifying possible pest hotspots, and developing detailed approaches to tackle such issues;
- Bank assistance is needed in organizing training/seminars with international experts to raise awareness of the population about the safety of neutralized hazardous waste sites;
- Bank assistance is needed to hold seminars/information events on World Bank requirements and international standards for local public service staff and financial oversight bodies;
- Technical assistance and training is requested on international best practices of management and protection of historical sites, in particular on the possibility of private entities, based on private-public-partnerships, to participate in management/protection of historical sites;
- Bank technical assistance and training is requested on environmental issues and social sustainability with a focus on best practice in development of law on plants/vegetation;
- A summary of reports containing statistics, quantitative and detailed technical analysis for institutional support of physical cultural resources protection would be useful;
- Bank support is requested to help further enhance introduction of new electronic document technologies to reduce paperwork and save time;
- Assistance is needed to improve social support systems for workers engaged in hazardous industries as well as practices to improve industrial safety;
- Mechanisms should be developed to inform the population about sustainable results of projects implemented worldwide, which successfully integrated environmental and social safeguard policies of the Bank in the lifecycle of the local population;
- Many operational issues raised during the meeting will be reflected in the Procedures Simplification Action Plan, which is being developed by the Joint Portfolio Monitoring Team involving the World Bank Country Team and Government counterparts.

## Annex 1



### The World Bank

### Review and Update of the World Bank's Environmental and Social Safeguard Policies

### Consultation Meeting

### List of Participants

**Date:** 29 March, 2013

**Venue:** World Bank Astana Office, Kazakhstan

| No. | Participant Name    | Organization Represented  |
|-----|---------------------|---|
| 1   | Serikkhan Shormanov | Senior Expert, Department of Labour Management & Social Partnerships, Ministry of Labour & Social Protection            |
| 2   | Gulzhan Akhmetova   | Expert, Department of Strategic Development & International Cooperation, Ministry of Labour and Social Protection       |
| 3   | Victor Rodionov     | Senior Expert, Department of Strategic Planning & International Cooperation, Ministry of Culture & Information          |
| 4   | Bolat Moldashev     | Senior Expert, Division of Historical & Cultural Heritage, Ministry of Culture and Information                          |
| 5   | Marat Kaliyev       | Head of Division, Department of Local Management & Rural & Boundary Areas Development, Ministry of Regional Development |
| 6   | Sergey Turumbayev   | Senior Expert, Forestry & Protected Areas Division, Forestry Committee, Ministry of Environmental Protection            |
| 7   | Tulebay Kenenbayev  | Senior Specialist, Water Resources Committee, Ministry of Environmental Protection                                      |
| 8   | Magauiya Kulzhanov  | Head of Department, RSE "KAZSUSHAR"   |
| 9   | Zamzagul Kozhayeva  | Expert of the division fishery protection, Fishery Committee, Ministry of Environmental Protection                      |
| 10  | Bakhyt Bekbergenova | Expert of the Committee on State sanitary-and-epidemiologic supervision, Ministry of Health                             |
| 11  | Malika Shonayeva    | Roads Committee, Ministry of Transport & Communications   |
| 12  | Assel Karymbayeva   | Roads Committee, Ministry of Transport & Communications   |

|    |                   |   |
|----|-------------------|---|
| 13 | Rauan Iskakov     | Head of Division of Industry Development, Agriculture & Environment, Department of Development of Industries of Economy, Ministry of Economic Development & Budget Planning |
| 14 | Kalima Mussina    | Procurement Consultant, Usk-Kamenogorsk Environmental Remediation Project   |
| 15 | Asanali Duysembay | Department for External Borrowings, Ministry of Finance   |
| 16 | Gaziza Katranova  | Expert of the Department of Electrical Energy & Coal Mining Industry, Ministry of Industry & Trade  |
| 17 | E. Badashev       | Ust-Kamenogorsk Environmental Remediation Project, Project coordinator  |
| 18 | Janna Ryssakova   | Facilitator   |