



## Towards a World Bank Group Gender Strategy Consultation Meeting 9 July 2015 Feedback Summary Kingston, Jamaica

---

The consultation meeting with **government** was held on **9 July 2015** in **Kingston, Jamaica**. After a presentation by the World Bank Group Gender Team on the background, intended scope and process for the strategy, the floor was open for participants' comments and recommendations. The summary below captures the main points and recommendations raised during the meeting.

**Total Number of Participants: 14.** A participant list is available [here](#).

### Feedback from Stakeholders

#### 1. KEY GENDER GAPS THE WORLD BANK GROUP SHOULD TAKE INTO CONSIDERATION AS PRIORITY TO HELP COUNTRIES REDUCE POVERTY AND PROMOTE MORE EQUITABLE SOCIETIES

The World Bank Group (WBG) should consider the following areas as priority:

- **More and better jobs.** The focus on more and better jobs resonated with the group. However, in the Jamaican context, due to limited growth and ongoing structural adjustment, more creative approaches should be considered. For example, “**micro-work**” via the internet was suggested as a way to take advantage of international job opportunities. The relationship between economic opportunities and migration was raised, more specifically the issue of “**brain drain**”. Exploration of “**brain waste**” was also suggested, i.e., not achieving one’s full potential due to limitations in the labor market.
- **Female labor force participation and labor market discrimination.** Women remain at a disadvantage in the workplace despite higher levels of education and qualification. Programs and policies to ensure that women attain jobs compensatory with training and ability levels are necessary. With respect to the labor market, the WBG should look at the legal barriers and gaps. The gap between the legal framework and its implementation is too large.

- **Gender gaps in pensions.** In addition to gender wage gaps, the WBG could also include work on gender gaps in pensions. Women live longer than men, but the nature of their work and the structure of pension laws can impact earnings during retirement. If women exit and enter the labor force, laws need to allow sufficient time for them to become vested in pension programs.
- **Informality.** The WBG should consider supporting women in the informal economy. Women are street vendors, informal commercial importers, and small farmers among other forms of informal work; therefore, specific measures are needed for them.
- **Transportation.** This is especially important for **women in rural areas** who find it a challenge to get to work because of high transportation costs.
- **Care.** Investment in care services is needed. The private sector could partner with the government to provide care services.
- **Assets. Land** plays a large role in gender equality. Currently rates of land ownership among women in Jamaica are especially low. In addition, women largely lack access to **agricultural extension services** and resources –an exploration of the cultural drivers in this area is needed.
- Access to **housing** also presents a large challenge. Currently the availability of housing solutions do not meet the demand. Lack of affordable housing is also particularly prevalent in parishes with large tourism offerings. Many people relocate to find employment in the tourism industry and then cannot find affordable housing solutions. Therefore investment in this area is essential, as well as upgrades to squatter settlements.
- **Education.** While women do outnumber men at the tertiary level, a more nuanced approach is needed for the Jamaican context. An access to education challenge exists more broadly.
- **Sexual and reproductive health and rights.** Sexual education is needed and should be included in the national curriculum.
- **Women’s political participation.** Jamaica is underperforming in this area. One of the core drivers is lack of funding to enter politics, which primarily affects women. Specific support could help to boost the number of women in politics.
- **Working with men and boys, more specifically, norms around masculinity and health-seeking behavior.** Gender norms that affect men’s engagement with health services needs to be addressed. There is a need for protective services and opportunities for them; these are generally not supported institutionally. In addition, the challenge of high male mortality rates and the linkage with poverty should be considered. A focus on **masculinities and dancehall music** should also be prioritized.
- **Norms.** Socialization and gender roles central to opportunities available to men and women, and impacts development outcomes. Without addressing root social issues relating to femininity and masculinity, many gender equality outcomes will not change. This is especially important, because while Jamaica has a progressive legal framework, it has regressive cultural norms, therefore, a specific emphasis on shifting norms is needed.
- **Gender-based violence.** GBV also poses a large challenge in the Jamaican context and requires a specific focus. In addition, the link between GBV and sanitation in poor communities should be explored.

- **Vulnerable populations.** Special attention needs to be paid to **poor senior citizens** and **persons with disabilities**, who remain without proper safety nets. In addition, **unattached youth** now important policy and programmatic concern with specific needs relating to crime prevention, job creation, education and gender-based violence.
- **Judicial reform.** Reform of the Sexual Offences Act is needed. Additionally, other issues, such as how to deal with citizens who are conflict with the law, protection of vulnerable witnesses, restorative justice and treatment of youth offenders, should be taken into consideration.

## 2. EXAMPLES OF PUBLIC AND PRIVATE SECTOR POLICIES, APPROACHES AND PROGRAMS THAT HAVE HELPED REMOVE ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL CONSTRAINTS TO WOMEN AND GIRLS AND THAT THE WORLD BANK GROUP STRATEGY COULD LEARN FROM

- **Jamaica’s Bureau of Women’s Affairs** changed to Bureau of Gender Affairs in order to enable better inclusion of **male inclusion in gender equality work**. Introduced male desk and Fathers Inc. facility.
- **Ministry of Tourism** implementing a **compulsory pension schedule** effective January 2017, which will serve as a lead for other sectors and ministries.
- **Jamaica Social Investment Fund’s “Institutional Strengthening in Gender Mainstreaming Project”**, while still in the beginning stages, could hold some lessons. The initiative aims to help government agencies integrate gender equality in their institutional mandates. In addition, it will target several communities and conduct community-level assessments of gender gaps, with special focus on those with disabilities and the elderly. JSIF will also create awareness-raising campaigns to alter gender stereotypes in close coordination with CSOs and will focus on widespread and practical dissemination. Awareness-raising will take place at schools, in communities and on street corners, for example.
- **Programme of Advancement Through Health and Education (PATH)**, Jamaica’s conditional cash transfer program, has grown from 180,000 beneficiaries (2005) to 400,000 beneficiaries (60% women). It has begun to incorporate employment and parenting training in order to respond to specific household-level gender equality challenges.

## 3. EXAMPLES OF POLICIES AND PROGRAMS THAT HAVE CREATED ACCESS TO BETTER JOBS FOR BOTH WOMEN AND MEN. ELEMENTS THAT HAVE MADE THESE WORK.

- **Ministry of Tourism** created a **“linkages hub”**, which aligns academic and technical training with job opportunities within sectors important for tourism – manufacturing, agriculture, etc. In addition, an emerging **community tourism policy** aims to better take advantage of global tourism trends (use of online search engines for private accommodations, etc.)
- **JSIF’s “Investing in Agribusiness”** project, funded by Caribbean Development Bank, focuses on rural communities and has social development linkages. For example, it provides technical assistance and certification for food handling, and aims to increase women’s participation in value chain. In addition, the program explicitly considers gender roles at the household level related to economic activities and care work and tailors its training accordingly. JSIF is in the process of developing training manual that incorporates these gender considerations.

- **Private sector is leading in day care and nursery provisions.** Private sector seeing increased productivity as a result. Potential exists for public-private partnerships to scale care provision and free constraints on women's time.

#### 4. RECOMMENDATIONS ON SOLUTIONS NEEDED TO INCREASE OWNERSHIP OF OR ACCESS TO LAND, HOUSING, FINANCE, AND TECHNOLOGY FOR WOMEN.

- **Land.** As noted above, land plays a large role in gender equality. Although legal barriers do not exist, rates of land ownership among women in Jamaica stand at 2 percent. Also, only 5 percent of agricultural extension services are directed towards women.
  - When individuals do not have a certificate of title, lower levels of titling could be considered if the land is not disputed. This would also enable the use of that land as collateral.
  - Focus on the property rights of spouses, which could enable men and women who are not married to benefit from property ownership.
  - Agricultural extension and training should begin to consider new populations, including the increasing number of subsistence and organic farmers in urban areas.
- **Housing.** Island nations have prohibitive costs for housing materials, there is a need for durable and indigenous building materials. Due to cost of construction/housing, rental markets need to be examined and regulated appropriately.
  - Estate administration is particularly onerous due to inheritances being tied up for generations and certificates of new titles experience major delays.
  - **Jamaica has instituted a National Land Titling Committee**, with the involvement of several key ministries, which has created better collaboration and coordination for the resolution of problems.

#### 5. RECOMMENDATIONS ON HOW THE WORLD BANK GROUP CAN BETTER SUPPORT COUNTRIES AND COMPANIES IN THEIR EFFORTS TO STRENGTHEN THEIR SYSTEMS AND INSTITUTIONS WITH RESPECT TO GENDER EQUALITY TO YIELD MORE SUSTAINABLE RESULTS

To help countries yield more sustainable results in the area of gender equality, the WBG should:

- **Share good practices.** Provide information on the areas of government policy and programs that make the largest impacts on gender equality outcomes; and establish minimum guarantees to provide social protection to men and women.
- **Monitor implementation of gender equality initiatives.** The WBG must ensure that governments are implementing and monitoring programs in an effective, timely way. This may require additional attention at a local level in consultations and monitoring efforts.
- **Include on community-based approaches and outreach.** World Bank has provided tremendous support to Jamaica, but community-level consultations are rare, and information about the programs does not consistently reach those who would most benefit. For example, in a recent survey conducted in Spanish Town (where 76% of household heads are women), 96%

of women were not aware of WBG-supported PATH program (CCT). The WBG should better support information and outreach at the community level to address gaps in information, uptake among most vulnerable households, and measurement of results. Additionally, some programs only implemented in communities aligned with specific political parties, others are not supported. On-the-ground engagement could ensure non-discrimination based on political affiliation.

- **Focus on results.** Institutions and governments face challenges **mainstreaming gender** within governments and institutions. Gender considerations (not only women's issues) need to be included in design and monitored throughout implementation. Due to the WBG's advisory role, it is positioned to advise how to consolidate efforts and produce better results. Gender Focal points exist within ministries, but gender lens not applied consistently across policy areas or program design; therefore, support is needed in this area. Additionally, the WBG should focus on its own results internally, there is a large gap in WBG projects between objectives and implementation. Deeper penetration to vulnerable communities is needed.
- **Support a legal framework and policy review.** WBG could help Jamaica to review its existing legal framework and policies to see if they are critically addressing gender equality in a coordinated way across ministries and sectors.
- **Support public-private partnerships in the area of housing.** Public-private partnerships may be necessary to produce affordable, sustainable housing solutions. In Jamaica, there is a major shortfall in the provision of public and private housing as previously noted. A policy framework exists, but implementation is inconsistent. Approximately 750 squatting communities exist, and adequate housing not readily available for low-income families seeking employment.
- **Tackle gender-based violence.** Judicial system needs specialized systems and training for gender-based violence cases. Specialized units concentrated in few areas, many police and judicial staff not adequately trained and some trivialize and reinforce violence behaviours.
- **Promote more equitable social protection.** Entitlements are largely dependent on employment in the formal sector. Therefore, the most vulnerable, who are engaged in informal work are excluded. Therefore, a social protection system that includes marginalized groups is essential. Additionally, take a **lifecycle approach** when addressing social protection.
- **Explore the potential of the tourism sector to provide employment opportunities.** Usually the ratio of employees to hotel rooms in the industry is 0.75 employees to 1 room and 1600 rooms are slated for development, therefore this provides an important opportunity to create jobs. Relatedly, the WBG should look at sectors that are already heavily dominated by women and try to boost their productivity. The crafts sector was given as an example. Currently, the majority of tourism crafts that are purchased in Jamaica are made in China. Women could be trained to create culturally relevant crafts and this could also be used to develop communities.
- **Support innovative education initiatives.** Jamaica Teaching Council has piloted differential approaches to teaching boys and girls; Ministry of Education planning how to implement at wider level to achieve better educational outcomes and avoid dropouts, especially for boys. The WBG could support the government in this area. Such programs need to be mainstreamed.
- Provide funding for the development of a **National Policy on Care.**

- **The WBG should also prioritize the following areas/issues:**
  - Entrepreneurship solutions, particularly as it relates to high unemployment.
  - Support for rural farmers.
  - Donor coordination, especially as it relates to ensuring that communities have equal access to the benefits of development projects.
  - Sustainability of its development interventions.
  - Retirement issues and pensions.
  - The promotion of flexi-work arrangements at the policy level.
  - A lifecycle approach, in general.

#### 6. IMPORTANT KNOWLEDGE GAPS – AREAS WHERE WE DON'T KNOW ENOUGH AND THE WORLD BANK GROUP SHOULD PRIORITIZE IN ITS WORK TO HELP CLOSE GENDER GAPS

- Employment data at a country level does not reflect those that have migrated in pursuit of better economic opportunities. **Data needs to accommodate migration and its impact on gender outcomes** as it relates to economic opportunities, jobs and financial support, especially in sub-regions where migration for work is common.
- In Jamaica, there is an increasing trend of **men being abused by women** (verbally and physically), but **very little data exists** and the issue not taken seriously.
- There is a **lack of information about how to formulate effective youth and education programs** that equip youth to be self-sufficient.
- There are currently no **rigorous measurements of impact of domestic violence in Jamaica**.
- There are currently no methods to **assess different learning outcomes of boys and girls** in Jamaica.
- Jamaica, despite very strong legal framework for women's rights and empowerment, does not consistently enforce these laws. Analysis does not exist on how **lack of enforcement of existing laws** creates further discrimination, and how it affects poverty reduction.

#### 7. ANY ADDITIONAL COMMENTS OR SUGGESTIONS.

- Gender is in many circumstances equated with "women." The **concept of gender equality** needs to be clarified. Additionally, discussions on gender equality should include data on gender gaps for men, and the inclusion of men in to discussions. Women's empowerment work remains crucial, but should include men instead of "demonizing" them.