



Towards a World Bank Group Gender Strategy Consultation Meeting with Civil Society: June 22, 2015 Feedback Summary Jakarta, Indonesia

The consultation meeting with **civil society representatives** was held on **June 22, 2015** in **Jakarta, Indonesia**. After a presentation by the World Bank Group Gender Team on the background, intended scope and process for the strategy, the floor was open for participants' comments and recommendations. The summary below captures the main points and recommendations raised during the meeting.

Total Number of Participants: 50. A participant list is available [here](#).

Feedback from Stakeholders

1. KEY GENDER GAPS THE WORLD BANK GROUP SHOULD TAKE INTO CONSIDERATION AS PRIORITY TO HELP COUNTRIES REDUCE POVERTY AND PROMOTE MORE EQUITABLE SOCIETIES

The World Bank Group (WBG) should consider the following areas as priority:

- **Asset ownership.** Gender gaps in this areas exist and women are disproportionately affected. In addition, access is also limited overall for the poor. Concern was expressed about the rights of the poor in this area.
- **Care.** Due to traditional norms, even when women gain access to employment, they are still expected to do domestic work, therefore leading to a double burden.
- **Access to finance services.** Helping women to establish small businesses was suggested as a way to improve economic opportunities and to serve as one pathway to reduce the risk of intimate partner violence. However, since collateral is typically registered under the names of husbands, this was identified as a key constraint for women.

- **Social norms.** Education should be considered as the mechanism to bring about behavioural change and work on social norms. While Indonesia has successfully closed the gender gap at all levels of education, a more nuanced approach should be applied, particularly one that considers behavioural change. Additionally, Indonesia was deemed to be a patriarchal society, hence the need to work on social norms.
- **Educational curricula.** The curricula should be a focus, especially the way it imparts norms surrounding gender roles. Typically in textbooks women are shown working in the household and men are shown working outside the home. Additionally, sexism appears in Physics textbooks, as well as ones that teach Bahasa Indonesia. A focus on educational stereotyping and getting more girls into Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics (STEM) was also suggested. Concern was also expressed about discrimination in the educational system against girls who wear hijabs.
- **The rights of female religious minorities.** Indonesia only recognizes 6 official religions (Islam, Protestantism, Catholicism, Hinduism, Buddhism and Confucianism). Women outside of these religious groups often face discrimination. The vulnerability of female religious minorities should be recognized, particularly in accessing national identifications, financial services and employment opportunities.

The WBG should also consider the following areas:

- **Persons with disabilities, particularly the visual- and hearing-impaired.** Additionally, women with disabilities are prone to sexual abuse.
- **Gender equality in customary communities.** Women in customary communities often suffer multiple forms of violence and have limited access to decision-making at the community level. In addition, the gender gap is growing for women as they lose access to natural resources, such as land, as a result of mining. Adequate legal protection for customary communities is needed.
- **Migrant workers.** More and more women are forced to work as migrant workers as a result of loss of natural resources. Additionally, due to lack of education, many women resort to this type of work.
- **Domestic workers.** Domestic workers are not considered formal workers with benefits and protections, therefore the legal framework needs to be strengthened. In addition, the Bank Group should also consider the children that are left behind and the need for a childcare mechanism for them.
- **Working with men and boys.**
- **Gender-based violence.**
- **Sexual orientation and gender identity.**

2. EXAMPLES OF PUBLIC AND PRIVATE SECTOR POLICIES, APPROACHES AND PROGRAMS THAT HAVE HELPED REMOVE ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL CONSTRAINTS TO WOMEN AND GIRLS AND THAT THE WORLD BANK GROUP STRATEGY COULD LEARN FROM

- The Bank Group strategy could learn from the following policies, approaches and programs:
 - **The “Behind the Brands” campaign.** This campaign assesses the performance of multinationals in a number of areas, such as gender, climate change and land rights. The WBG could learn from this transformative approach, specifically in the area of gender equality.
 - **“Movement of Math Savvy Mothers”.** This program trains mothers in basic arithmetic so that they can teach their children at home.
 - **“Hivos’ Biogas for All”** program as a model for public-private partnerships (PPP). As a result of this initiative, coordination among the private sector, donors, cooperatives and individual farmers was established.
 - **PEKKA’s work with government departments on data quality and on access to legal identity.** PEKKA has been successful in working with Religious Courts to collect village level data on the number of people that require birth and marriage certificates, which is used to set the Religious Court’s annual budget for providing these services. This was shared as a good practice participatory approach.
 - **Innovations in maternal health.** In West Sumatra, ambulances that are managed by the heads of villages are provided for pregnant women. Moreover, health workers conduct outreach beforehand to anticipate the needs of pregnant women. They also try to estimate delivery dates and align them with ambulance services.
 - **A dual approach to gender-based violence.** More specifically advocating legally for women through a paralegal system and working directly with men on norms around the acceptability and use of violence.
 - **The role of technology in boosting voice and agency.** In some districts, mobile technology, i.e., cellular phones, is being used to connect women to their community leaders in a matter of hours to raise issues of concern. Therefore, creative approaches, especially those that involve technology, could hold lessons.
 - **Engaging progressive religious leaders.** Progressive religious leaders can be important catalysts in the promotion of behaviour change around issues, such as family planning.

3. RECOMMENDATIONS ON HOW THE WORLD BANK GROUP CAN BETTER SUPPORT COUNTRIES AND COMPANIES IN THEIR EFFORTS TO STRENGTHEN THEIR SYSTEMS AND INSTITUTIONS WITH RESPECT TO GENDER EQUALITY TO YIELD MORE SUSTAINABLE RESULTS

To help countries yield more sustainable results in the area of gender equality, the WBG should:

- **Focus on care.** The Bank Group should not push for increase women’s economic participation without alleviating the burden of household work. A more equitable division of household work should be promoted by pushing for male inclusion in this area. The WBG should put pressure of parliament to provide public childcare solutions.

- **Consider a rights-based approach.** Without including human rights, gender equality will never be achieved. This approach should be incorporated. The WBG should shift the paradigm from the needs approach to the rights-based approach. The failure of the MDGs on gender can be attributed to the instrumental approach to gender equality.
- **Include sexual orientation and gender identity issues.** Participants recommended that the definition of gender should move beyond the binary. They expressed a desire for the strategy to be inclusive in this way. Additionally, a special focus on the vulnerability of the transgender community was requested. The WBG should recognize the third gender and the limitations they face in terms of access to education and employment due to discrimination.
- **Improve clarity around the concept of gender equality,** particularly among decision-makers in government who currently have limited knowledge around the issue. This could account for the creation of policies that are gender-blind.
- **Engage with the financial sector to promoted access to credit for farmers engaged in the “Hivos’ Biogas for All” program.** While the program serves as a model for PPP, farmers face a bottleneck when trying to access loans. Farmers need financial support when trying to develop profitable businesses in this area. **The WBG can make a difference here by engaging with the financial sector and promoting increased access to credit, particularly for women-led businesses.**
- **Focus on the legal framework and related barriers.** Recently Aceh has implemented **limitations on women’s work and movement** at night. Additionally, the constitutional court’s rejection of the judicial review on the **minimum age of marriage** was also raised as a concern. The WBG should engage the government in these areas.
- **Promote inclusion in dialogue with the private sector.** In its interactions with the private sector, the WBG should push the private sector to include marginalized groups, particularly sexual minorities.

On the **implementation of the gender strategy**, the WBG should ensure:

- A good monitoring and evaluation framework for its strategy.
- A focus on results and a pivot away from measuring inputs.

The WBG should also:

- Raise community awareness about gender equality.
- Focus on Indonesia’s bureaucratic reform process.

4. IMPORTANT KNOWLEDGE GAPS – AREAS WHERE WE DON'T KNOW ENOUGH AND THE WORLD BANK GROUP SHOULD PRIORITIZE IN ITS WORK TO HELP CLOSE GENDER GAPS

To help close knowledge and data gaps, the WBG should:

- **Support a survey on time use and unpaid work.** This will help to quantify the contribution of unpaid work to the economy and to assess the magnitude of the challenge. In addition, this data would help to equip civil society in its dialogue with policymakers.
- **Address data incongruence.** While the national census typically gathers data at the household level, many households typically include more than one family, therefore leading to inaccuracies. The family could be a more effective unit of analysis.
- **Support a change in the definition of the head of the household.** When data on the head of the family is collected, even when women are breadwinners they often say that their husband is the head of the family due to social norms. In addition, under the marriage law, men are considered the head of the family, therefore women's earnings are always considered to be supplementary. Due to how the data is collected, it is difficult to identify women who are breadwinners. This could affect social protection targeting and also limits access to information about decision-making in the family and household. **The WBG could help to support changes to how the data is collected and propose questions specific to the breadwinner, rather than the head of family and/or household.**

5. RECOMMENDATIONS AND/OR EXAMPLES OF BETTER DIAGNOSTIC TOOLS THAT CAN BE USED TO HELP THE UNDERSTANDING OF CONSTRAINTS TO GENDER EQUALITY – BEYOND THOSE CURRENTLY USED BY THE WORLD BANK GROUP, IE. COUNTRY GENDER ASSESSMENT AND RESEARCH ON GENDER.

- Exploring the "Gender Harmony" report was suggested.

6. ANY ADDITIONAL COMMENTS OR SUGGESTIONS.

- Address growing religious extremism.
- Better communicate gender results and engagements locally.