



Towards a World Bank Group Gender Strategy Consultation Meeting with Government: June 22, 2015 Feedback Summary Jakarta, Indonesia

The consultation meeting with **government representatives** was held on **June 22, 2015** in **Jakarta, Indonesia**. After a presentation by the World Bank Group Gender Team on the background, intended scope and process for the strategy, the floor was open for participants' comments and recommendations. The summary below captures the main points and recommendations raised during the meeting.

Total Number of Participants: 25. A participant list is available [here](#).

Feedback from Stakeholders

1. KEY GENDER GAPS THE WORLD BANK GROUP SHOULD TAKE INTO CONSIDERATION AS PRIORITY TO HELP COUNTRIES REDUCE POVERTY AND PROMOTE MORE EQUITABLE SOCIETIES

- The World Bank Group (WBG) should prioritize the following areas in Indonesia:
 - **Gender gaps in access to identification and its link to financial inclusion.** Currently, 21 percent of female-headed households lack access to IDs versus 12 percent of male-headed households. Lack of identification then works to limit access to financial services, such as bank accounts. Additionally, women are at a distinct disadvantage in terms of interacting with bureaucracies because of the existing demands on their time.
 - **Care.** While many women would like to participate in the economy outside the household, the care burden is prohibitive. While the government has started a program to boost care services, this is not mandatory in businesses. Additionally, for female-headed households, the dependency ratio for the bottom 30 percent is higher than it is for the male-headed household.

- **Asset ownership and spousal rights.** Rather than only focusing on whether women own households assets, concentrating on spousal rights was suggested. Women’s awareness regarding asset ownership was not perceived to be the problem, but rather their lack of awareness of their rights to household assets. There should be a focus on protecting and informing on those rights to use (or transfer) assets. This would also help take focus away from land rights. Additionally, if the WBG only collects data on women’s asset ownership in Indonesia, it will appear that women are dispossessed, which was considered a distortion.
- **Women’s decision-making, especially at the village level.** Most government officials at this level are men, therefore women are often excluded from decisions about budget and community priorities.
- **Land rights.** Land is a major issue and the source of much conflict in Indonesia. This is an issue for both men and women. While the government is usually pushing for increased access to land titles, communities treat and use land communally.
- **Improving the understanding of the concept of gender.** Currently, many perceive gender to mean women, therefore more clarity is needed. Additionally, it is important to expand the concept of gender to include **sexual orientation and gender identity (SOGI)**.
- Regarding **SOGI issues, extensive public dialogue is needed** in this area.
- **Norms.** It is essential to focus on norms in Indonesia, with special consideration for the wide range of diversity that exists in the country. For example, regressive norms can be found in societies outside of Java. In addition, norms in turn affect access to finance. For instance, participants shared that while banks do not have formal barriers to women accessing finance, often women still need permission from their husbands to take out loans.
- **Women’s political participation and extremism.** It is essential to address growing extremism and rising Shari’a law at the sub-national level. Working to boost women’s political participation could be one way to counter this growth. Additionally, a **system of incentives** is needed to encourage women to participate more in politics.
- Other areas for the WBG’s consideration include:
 - **Gender-based violence.**
 - Working with **men and boys.**
 - **Skills development**, particularly life, social and vocational skills for women.
 - **Voice and agency**, especially as it relates to women’s leadership.
 - **Single mother families**, which often lack resilience and economic security.
 - **Transportation**, particularly services for pregnant women.
 - Vulnerability of **migrant workers.**

2. EXAMPLES OF PUBLIC AND PRIVATE SECTOR POLICIES, APPROACHES AND PROGRAMS THAT HAVE HELPED REMOVE ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL CONSTRAINTS TO WOMEN AND GIRLS AND THAT THE WORLD BANK GROUP STRATEGY COULD LEARN FROM

- The WBG could learn from the lessons drawn from the attempted implementation of **gender-responsive budgeting (GRB)** in Indonesia. A budget statement was introduced and ministerial pilots have been underway since 2009. The results of these pilots are not clear, but to ensure effectiveness, suggestions were made for linking this initiative to ongoing work in the government. For example, if good governance is now the focus of the government, link gender equality to good governance initiatives. Current GRB activities were linked to previous performance based budgeting work.
- The Bank Group could learn from the Australia Indonesia Partnership for Justice's (AIPJ) **women against corruption** campaign.
- The Bank Group could learn from **“pro-women” policies implemented through National Program for Community Empowerment or Program Nasional Pemberdayaan Mandiri (PNPM)**.
- The WBG could learn from ongoing work with the New Men Alliance, in changing norms.

3. RECOMMENDATIONS ON SOLUTIONS NEEDED TO INCREASE OWNERSHIP OF OR ACCESS TO LAND, HOUSING, FINANCE, AND TECHNOLOGY FOR WOMEN.

- To address the **gender gap in access to identification**, the WBG could engage the government of Indonesia during its bureaucratic reform process to accelerate efforts designed to improve access. The ongoing **National Program for Community Empowerment** was also suggested as a good outreach mechanism to boost access to IDs.
- The WBG can support existing activities to **register women for bank accounts through mobile units** (buses that travel to remote areas).
- **IDs** are also needed to obtain **tax identification numbers**, which in turn are needed to open businesses. Women often lack access these tax numbers and often use their husbands' tax IDs, which creates a dependency, including risk of losing the business in a divorce. Therefore, the WBG could also **focus its efforts on solutions in this area**.

4. RECOMMENDATIONS ON HOW THE WORLD BANK GROUP CAN BETTER SUPPORT COUNTRIES AND COMPANIES IN THEIR EFFORTS TO STRENGTHEN THEIR SYSTEMS AND INSTITUTIONS WITH RESPECT TO GENDER EQUALITY TO YIELD MORE SUSTAINABLE RESULTS

- The WBG could help the government to **develop a macroeconomic policy on gender**. Currently, more work is needed to ensure that government representatives in economic sectors understand how gender equality relates to a broader macroeconomic policy framework. Gender-responsive macroeconomic policies are needed.
- The WBG should make an effort to **ensure that women participate meaningfully in development projects, especially at the village level**. Most functionaries at this level are men, who often have information on village programs and available funding. However, women are often excluded from these activities and this funding. Consequently, projects that do not benefit the community sometimes ensue. The WBG should therefore be engaging with government to adopt practices from its national

community empowerment programs that were successful in promoting women's participation in local decision-making and ensuring local development resources are invested in ways that benefit women.

- **The Bank Group should not isolate itself to economic issues.** It should **work actively on political issues**, more specifically addressing the electoral system, financing of political parties and transparency. Working on these issues could help to boost women's representation, since the current quota of 30 percent has not been achieved. Moreover, echelon 1 positions have been opened by the government, therefore the **WBG could engage in this area and try to get more women into these positions.**
- To better support Indonesia in strengthening its gender equality results, the WBG should **focus on the implementation of policies**, rather than just policies themselves. Presidential Decree No. 9 dictates that gender should be integrated in all policies and activities. To facilitate implementation, ministries need support with the specific processes of gender mainstreaming. In addition, **capacity building is needed for all decision makers in government.**
- The WBG should focus its efforts on building a **critical mass of gender expertise**. While a gender mainstreaming structure with gender focal points exists, expertise is often lacking.
- The Indonesia's national policy on gender is structured around three main themes: gender mainstreaming, good governance and sustainable development. **The WBG should address these issues in an integrated way**, currently actions in these areas are splintered and therefore not as effective.
- The **Ministry of Environment** should be **more integrated into the current policy dialogue**, particularly since many environmental issues have gender dimensions.
- The hyper-regulation that is emerging from the **bureaucratic reform process** could directly reduce access to midwives for women. Due to increased regulation, approximately 40,000 midwives could be disbarred. The WBG could try to engage in this area.
- WBG could support the development of a **comprehensive social protection system** with one single card.
- Other recommendations include:
 - Consider a **rights-based approach**.
 - Help to **scale up gender-responsive budgeting efforts**.
 - Take a **lifecycle approach**.
 - Focus on **women at the household level**, who are involved primarily in the informal sector.

5. IMPORTANT KNOWLEDGE GAPS – AREAS WHERE WE DON'T KNOW ENOUGH AND THE WORLD BANK GROUP SHOULD PRIORITIZE IN ITS WORK TO HELP CLOSE GENDER GAPS

- The Bank Group should focus on **developing time use data**, currently there is a lack of data on unpaid care work.
- The WBG should focus its **gender analysis at the family level, rather than the household level**. Many households typically include more than one family, therefore the census data is distorted. This should also be linked to ID issues, since a “family card” exists and could help to improve the accuracy of the data.
- Support countries in using **data specifically to make the case for gender equality**. A **business case for policymaking** is essential.
- The WBG could **help the government to identify the optimum threshold for conditional cash transfer programs**. There are challenges in understanding the optimum amount of support that will help families to escape poverty but will also prevent dependency.
- The Bank Group could analyze **Indonesia’s financial inclusion challenges and help to establish the necessary infrastructure**. The bottom 30-40 percent of the population should be targeted, as they are likely excluded from the system. **The WBG could support a cost-benefit analysis of targeting this group**.
- Concerns were expressed about the accuracy of census data. Complementary community-based measures were suggested as a way to provide a system of “checks and balances”.

6. ANY ADDITIONAL COMMENTS OR SUGGESTIONS.

- Establish more linkages with CSOs.
- Work with progressive religious organizations and leaders to intervene early regarding radical norms.
- Address growing extremism.